

LATE ANTIQUE AND EARLY MEDIEVAL IBERIA



Edited by Andrew Fear and Jamie Wood

Isidore of Seville and his Reception in the Early Middle Ages

Transmitting and Transforming Knowledge

Amsterdam
University
Press

Isidore of Seville and his Reception in the Early Middle Ages

Transmitting and Transforming Knowledge

*Edited by
Andrew Fear and Jamie Wood*

Amsterdam University Press

Cover illustration: Statue of Isidore of Seville on the front steps of the Biblioteca Nacional de España in Madrid (Wikimedia Commons, Luis García)

Cover design: Coördesign, Leiden

Lay-out: Crius Group, Hulshout

Amsterdam University Press English-language titles are distributed in the US and Canada by the University of Chicago Press.

ISBN 978 90 8964 828 0

e-ISBN 978 90 4852 676 5 (pdf)

DOI 10.5117/9789089648280

NUR 684

© Andrew Fear & Jamie Wood / Amsterdam University Press B.V., Amsterdam 2016

All rights reserved. Without limiting the rights under copyright reserved above, no part of this book may be reproduced, stored in or introduced into a retrieval system, or transmitted, in any form or by any means (electronic, mechanical, photocopying, recording or otherwise) without the written permission of both the copyright owner and the author of the book.

Every effort has been made to obtain permission to use all copyrighted illustrations reproduced in this book. Nonetheless, whosoever believes to have rights to this material is advised to contact the publisher.

Table of Contents

Preface	7
<i>Paul Fouracre</i>	
1 Introduction	11
<i>Andrew Fear and Jamie Wood</i>	
2 A Family Affair	31
Leander, Isidore and the Legacy of Gregory the Great in Spain	
<i>Jamie Wood</i>	
3 Variations on a Theme	57
Isidore and Pliny on Human and Human-Instigated Anomaly	
<i>Mary Beagon</i>	
4 Putting the Pieces Back Together	75
Isidore and De Natura Rerum	
<i>Andrew Fear</i>	
5 The Politics of History-Writing	93
Problematizing the Historiographical Origins of Isidore of Seville in Early Medieval Hispania	
<i>Michael J. Kelly</i>	
6 Isidorian Texts in Seventh-Century Ireland	111
<i>Marina Smyth</i>	
7 Isidore of Seville in Anglo-Saxon England	131
The <i>Synonyma</i> as a Source of Felix's <i>Vita S. Guthlaci</i>	
<i>Claudia Di Sciacca</i>	
8 Hispania et Italia	159
Paul the Deacon, Isidore, and the Lombards	
<i>Christopher Heath</i>	

9	Rylands MS Latin 12 A Carolingian Example of Isidore's Reception into the Patristic Canon <i>Melissa Markauskas</i>	177
10	Adoption, Adaptation, & Authority The Use of Isidore in the Opus Caroli <i>Laura Carlson</i>	209
	Abbreviations	231
	Index	233

Preface

Paul Fouracre, University of Manchester

'God's anger was shown so clearly that a star appeared in the heavens – the star astrologers call a comet: when it rises, they say, the earth is convulsed with hunger, with the swift succession of kings, with the movement of peoples, and the clashing of swords threatens it'. These are the words of a Frankish hagiographer writing probably in the early 680s. He (we can be almost certain that it was a 'he') was describing the interregnum of 675/6 which led to the death of his hero, Leudegar, bishop of Autun. The passage just quoted came from Isidore's *Etymologies* (3.71.16). For an author who rarely moves beyond the scriptural in his borrowings, it is remarkable to see him turning to Isidore in this way. The borrowing is testimony both to the rapid dissemination of Isidore's works across Western Europe and to their importance as tools for explaining human vicissitudes in a turbulent world.

Several of the chapters in this volume derive from a day workshop that was held at the Instituto Cervantes in Manchester in April 2013. The aim in putting together the volume was to combine these pieces with some specially-commissioned studies in order to create the first English-language collected volume on Isidore. Drawing on the strong scholarly tradition in the study of Isidore in France and Spain, as well as the increasing number of new editions of key Isidorian texts, the volume incorporates original contributions from established and early career scholars that provide a chronologically and geographically coherent overview of Isidore's impact across Western Europe in the early medieval period, from Spain, Ireland, England, Italy and Francia.

The debt Western European learning of the Early Middle Ages owed to Isidore as a transmitter and translator of the classical tradition is more or less a given in narratives of intellectual history. A collection of essays that clarifies, highlights nuances and further explains his contribution is therefore most welcome. It is particularly useful to juxtapose the Iberian context of Isidore's work with its reception in other cultures: the collection demonstrates, as the editors put it, 'that there was not one Isidorian legacy but many'. And as Christopher Heath's chapter suggests, we can identify that legacy in works which do not actually quote him. Heath's thinking was in fact prompted by a question at a seminar in London where he presented a structural analysis of the works of Paul the Deacon. There, a distinguished classicist asked, 'Where is Isidore in all this?' Well, in linguistic terms,

strictly nowhere, but was it conceivable that Paul, writing in the later eighth century, was influenced by Isidore? Careful research reveals that indeed he was: Paul's praise of Italy turns out to owe a great deal to Isidore's *Laus Spaniae*. One reason for thinking that Paul must have been familiar with Isidore's work is that he was a fixture of the Carolingian cultural project into which Paul was himself co-opted. Laura Carlson explains how the Carolingian intelligentsia were reliant on Isidore to formulate their views on spirituality, especially in relation to image and language. Interestingly it was another Spaniard, Theodulf of Orléans, who led the thinking here, and Theodulf was very proud of his Iberian heritage. Melissa Markauskas further shows how Carolingians reached for their Isidore to help them navigate Patristic material. In short, for the Carolingians Isidore was also the 'go to' for political ideas, for explanations of natural phenomena, for the definitions of orthodoxy and heresy, and for the conception of Iberia itself. It is surely no coincidence that when the Carolingians tried to put that religious definition into practice by presenting themselves as the standard bearers of orthodoxy, they turned their fire upon Adoptionism, a peculiarly Spanish (and frankly rather obscure) heresy. More surprising at first sight is to find the influence of Isidore's *Synonyma* upon Felix's *Life of Guthlac*, for this is set in the early eighth century in the badlands around Crowland, still today a remote spot in the Lincolnshire fens. But as Claudia di Sica makes clear, it is not that surprising given the fact that Isidore was, in the words of our editors, 'a staple figure of early Anglo-Saxon libraries'.

Isidore's influence spread like the Atlantic tide, up from Spain, round the British Isles and down into Francia, as well as by land across into Francia from the south. The two pulses met in Alcuin and Theodulf, the Northumbrian and the Spaniard, two bitter rivals at Charlemagne's court. Despite their differences (porridge versus spicy sausage, according to Theodulf), they shared political ideas about how society could be 'corrected' and how it should be ruled that were ultimately derived from Isidore. The historical importance of this political/cultural narrative demands that we get it right. When, exactly, did Isidore's works reach Ireland, Marina Smyth asks. How did Isidore make use of Pliny? Critically, answers Mary Beagon. Did Isidore really wish to preserve a separate sphere of secular learning? Definitely not, argues Andrew Fear. These are questions and answers that bring us closer to understanding the Isidorian phenomenon. As important is understanding the context in which Isidore wrote, and how the whole project evolved. Jamie Wood is enlightening on Isidore's family and the importance of Leander's encounter with Pope Gregory I. Finally, Michael J. Kelly unsettles us with the suggestion that there was actually a Spanish 'school' in opposition to

Isidore's legacy. What, one wonders, would the early medieval intellectual world have been like if they had succeeded in crushing it?

This last question points to an elephant in the room: evaluation. Was Isidore's legacy massive because his works were brilliant? Was his elision of secular and Christian scholarship so successful that it set a template that could not be improved upon? Did the legacy actually prevent alternatives being developed? Or might it have been the case that there was simply no effective competition because no one else had such a command of ancient learning? This would certainly seem to be true for the *Etymologies* – hence our Frankish hagiographer turning to them for the meaning of comets. It does look, too, as if Isidore's political ideas were about all that were available to early medieval thinkers, from pseudo-Cyprian to Hincmar, from late seventh-century Ireland to late ninth-century Francia (hence Alcuin and Theodulf agreeing on rule and justice and very little else). Jacques Fontaine hinted that it was the poverty of the barbarian intellect that threw Isidore into such sharp relief and made his works so desirable to distant peoples. But if it were Isidore who set the terms for relating knowledge to God, showed the relationship between the natural and the divine orders, and the way for rulers to obey a divine mandate, then should we also hold him responsible for the unremitting masculinity of discourse in all of these areas? His conception of Christian order was, after all, predicated on the subordination of women. Starting from a counterfactual basis, these may be unfair questions, and certainly a collection of essays around the theme of *Transmitting and Transforming Knowledge: Isidore of Seville and his Reception in the Early Middle Ages* has no brief to pose or answer them. But it is testimony to the clarity with which these essays bring out the importance of Isidore's transmission and Christianisation of knowledge that such questions creep into the readers' minds. In other words, Isidore is good to think with, and always fascinating to read about, as will become very clear in what follows.

1 Introduction¹

Andrew Fear and Jamie Wood

‘The Great Doctor of our times, the newest ornament of the Catholic Church, last in time but by no means least in the field of doctrine [...] the most learned man in these latter times, he whom one should name with reverence, Isidore [...]’²

Such was the judgement on Isidore of Seville of the bishops who had gathered for the eighth Council of Toledo in 653, some 18 years after his death. Later ages have agreed – Dante placed the *ardente spiro* of Isidore alongside Solomon and Boethius in Paradise;³ in the eighteenth century Isidore was elevated to the status of *Doctor* of the church by the intellectually minded Pope Innocent XIII; and in the late twentieth century he was to become unofficially the patron saint of computer programmers and of the Internet.

Long the subject of detailed analysis in Spanish and French scholarship⁴, the past decade has witnessed a flowering of interest in Isidore in the Anglophone world.⁵ As well as playing an important role in the ecclesiastical and

1 We would like to thank the staff of the Instituto Cervantes for their support and the participants at the workshop we held there in 2013 for their feedback on the papers that were delivered there, as well as the members of the Medieval Studies Research Group at the University of Lincoln for comments offered on an early draft of the introduction to this volume. Thanks must also go to the four anonymous reviewers of the manuscript and to staff at Amsterdam University Press, especially Erin Dailey and Tyler Cloherty, for their support in bringing this volume to publication.

2 *Nostri seculi doctor egregius, ecclesiae catholicae novissimum decus, praecedentibus aetate prostremus, doctrinae comparatione non infimus... in seculorum fine doctissimus atque cum reverentia nominandus Ysidorus, Canon 2*, which cites Isidore’s *Sententiae* as justification for this assessment. For the text of the council see Vives, ed., *Concilios Visigoticos e Hispano-Romanos* pp. 260-296, the quotation can be found on page 276.

3 *Paradiso* 10.130.

4 For comprehensive bibliographies of studies on Isidore and his works see: Hillgarth, ‘The Position of Isidorian Studies’; Hillgarth, ‘Isidorian Studies’; Ferreiro, *The Visigoths in Gaul and Spain, A.D. 418-711: A Bibliography*, pp. 327-409; Ferreiro, *The Visigoths in Gaul and Iberia: a supplemental bibliography, 1984-2003*, pp. 299-409; Ferreiro, *The Visigoths in Gaul and Iberia (Update): A Supplemental Bibliography, 2004-2006*, pp. 113-144.

5 Recent monographs include, but are by no means limited to: Merrills, *History and Geography*; Henderson, *The Medieval World of Isidore of Seville*; Di Sciaccia, *Finding the Right Words*; Warntjes, *The Munich Computus*; Wood, *The Politics of Identity*. For extensive bibliography on more recent work on Isidore, see: Ferreiro, *The Visigoths in Gaul and Iberia (update): a supplemental bibliography, 2004-2006*, pp. 113-144; Ferreiro, *The Visigoths in Gaul and Iberia (update)*:

royal politics of the first third of the seventh century, as the accolades above demonstrate, Isidore had a considerable impact in the seventh century and throughout the medieval period, especially in the Latin world. Sources written and influenced by Isidore are fundamental to our understanding of the seventh century in Spain and it could be argued that his influence on the written record for the period lends him a higher historical significance even than the Visigothic kings who were his contemporaries. Yet Isidore did not work alone and we might do better imagining him as the best remembered of a coterie of prolific Spanish bishops in the late sixth and seventh centuries. As some of the studies in this volume demonstrate, his legacy was by no means uncontested: the later reception and transmission of his works was both extensive and highly variable in both form and content. The chapters in this volume explore the relationship between the historical situation in which Isidore worked and his posthumous legacy; it is through putting these contexts in dialogue with one another that we can better understand both early seventh century Spain and the remouldings of Isidore's works and image later in the Middle Ages.

Isidore was probably born in the city where he would later become bishop in around AD 601. Very little is known of his family who were of Hispano-Roman, not Gothic, origin. Severian, his father, said in some later accounts to have been a high-ranking official, was a native of the province of Carthaginiensis in the south-east, but was forced to flee as a consequence of either the Byzantine invasion of the Peninsula in AD 552 or of finding himself on the wrong side of the civil war that was raging between King Agila and his rival Athanagild at that same time.⁶ Isidore is often said to have been born in the 560s/570s, but the sole foundation for this is an assumption that he became a bishop as soon as his age allowed. This is itself a problematic point, though we know that the two councils of the Trinitarian Church, those of Agde (506) and Arles (524), decreed that 30 was the youngest age for a man to be made a bishop or indeed a cleric of any kind and that this was confirmed by canons 19 and 20 of the fourth Council of Toledo in 633, which was presided over by Isidore. Nevertheless it is dangerous to assume that Isidore's elder brother, Leander, whom he immediately succeeded as Bishop of Seville, died precisely at the time when

a supplemental bibliography, 2007-2009, pp. 135-174; Ferreiro, *The Visigoths in Gaul and Iberia (update): a supplemental bibliography, 2010-2012*, pp. 133-168.

6 The most important biographical writings are collected in Martín, *Scripta de vita Isidori episcopi Hispalensis*. For a discussion of the traditions concerning Isidore see Fontaine and Cazier, 'Qui a chasse de Carthaginoise Sévérianus et les siens?' and Kelly's chapter in this volume. For Isidore's family see Wood's chapter in this volume.

his younger sibling could take his place, so it may well be that Isidore's birth should be pushed back in time.

In his youth Isidore lived with his brother and, as Leander was a monk, he may also have taken up the monastic life, although this is not clear.⁷ The elder brother was well educated and seems to have taken personal care of Isidore's education. The prose style of Leander's surviving works is decidedly Ciceronian and this has led Fontaine to insist that Severian had given a good classical education to his son.⁸ Isidore in his brief biography of his brother describes him as 'eloquent in speech, most outstanding in ability'.⁹ Sadly most of Leander's work has been lost; all that remains are a rule for nuns and a homily delivered on the conversion of the kingdom to Trinitarianism (the *De Triumpho Ecclesiae ob Conversionem Gothorum*). From Isidore we learn that Leander also wrote 'two books against heretical dogmas (no doubt Arianism) full of learning from the scriptures'.¹⁰

Leander sought, it seems, to cultivate a culture of learning within the Church in Spain in order to better serve the pastoral and spiritual needs of the population. Isidore succeeded his brother as bishop of Seville in 601 and remained in office until his death on 4th April 636, producing a large number of writings across a range of genres during his long episcopacy. We have two lists of Isidore's works. One was compiled by Ildefonsus of Toledo in his *De viris illustribus* at some point between 659 and 667, the other by Braulio of Saragossa not long after Isidore's death, in what is now known as the *Renotatio librorum domini Isidori* (*praenotatio* is also found).¹¹ Braulio intended this document to be a supplement to Isidore's own *De viris illustribus* and his list is by far the more complete of the two.¹² Besides 'many other minor writings' that he does not name,¹³ Braulio lists the following seventeen major works, perhaps in the order of their composition:¹⁴

7 Leander, *De Institutione virginum et contempt mundi* 31.

8 Fontaine, *Isidore de Séville*, p. 6. Fontaine believes that Leander's prose is 'nettement supérieure' to that of Isidore. For a detailed examination of Leander's prose style, see Martin, *Saint Leander*, pp. 13-27.

9 Isidore, *De Viris Illustribus* 41: *suavis eloquio, ingenio prestantissimus*.

10 *duos adversus haereticorum dogmata libros*.

11 See Michael J. Kelly's chapter in this volume for more on the relationship between these two texts.

12 Edition and translation into Spanish by Martín.

13 *Multa alia opuscula*.

14 This has been the assumption of most scholars and was the basis for de Aldama's chronology of Isidore's writings: 'Indicaciones sobre la cronología'. For doubts see Elfassi in Chiesa and Castaldi, p. 202.

The *Differentiae* (two books): a work which deals with the difference and correct usage of apparent synonyms and homophones. Its second book also deals with the differences between different categories of beings.¹⁵

The *Prooemia*: a summary of the contents of each of the books of the Bible.¹⁶

De ortu et obitu Patrum: a series of short biographies of key Biblical figures.¹⁷

De ecclesiasticis officiis (two books): dedicated to his brother Fulgentius, the bishop of Écija. The first of the two books gives a history of the Catholic liturgy, while the second describes the duties of ecclesiastic officials.¹⁸

The *Synonyma* (two books): sometimes known as the *Liber lamentationum*, this is in fact a religious work set as a dialogue between Man and Reason. Man laments his fallen state, while Reason consoles him by showing how he might still be saved. The work takes its name from the 'synonymous style' of arguing, where the points made are repeated via the use of synonyms. The popularity of this technique gave rise to the so-called *stylus Isidorianus* in the Middle Ages.¹⁹

De natura rerum: dedicated to the Gothic King Sisebut, this is an exposition of the natural world and phenomena of nature. After the *Etymologies*, it was perhaps the most widely read of Isidore's works.²⁰

De numeris: an examination of the mystical significance of the numbers found in the Bible.²¹

15 Edition of book one and translation into Spanish, Codoñer; edition of book two, Andrés Sanz; translation into English by Throop.

16 Edition by Andrés Sanz.

17 Edition by Carrecedo Fraga, another edition and translation into Spanish by Chaparro Gómez.

18 Edition by Lawson, translation into English by Knoebel.

19 Edition by Elfassi; translation into Spanish by Viñayo González; translation into English by Throop.

20 Edition and translation into French by Fontaine; translation into Italian by Trisoglio.

21 Edition by Arévalo, *PL* 83. 1293-1302. The authenticity of this text has been challenged. McNally, *Isidoriana* and *Der irische Liber de Numeris*, believes the original Isidorian work to be lost and this text to be a product of an eighth century Irish author. However Dekkers and Gaar, *Clavis patrum Latinorum*, consider that it could be a genuine work by Isidore.

De nominibus legis et evangelorum [often referred to as the *Allegoriae*]: a discussion of the allegorical meaning of Biblical names.²²

De haeresibus [now lost]: this work is likely to have dealt with Arianism, but also the Acephalites whom Braulio tells us Isidore expressly opposed.²³

Sententiae (three books): a systematic treatise on church doctrine and the Christian life. One important source for the work is the *Moralia* of Gregory the Great.²⁴

Chronicon: Isidore's *Chronicle* draws heavily of that of Eusebius as translated by Jerome.²⁵

De fide Catholica contra Judaeos (two books): allegedly written at the request of Isidore's sister, the abbess Florentina. This treatise is ostensibly a polemic aimed at persuading Jews to convert to Christianity, but in fact is a theological work which has a Christian audience as its target.²⁶

De viris illustribus: a series of brief biographies of Church Fathers and essentially a continuation of St Jerome's work of the same name.²⁷

Monastica regula: a discussion in praise of monastic life with practical advice on its practice.²⁸

De origine Gothorum et regno Suevorum et etiam Wandalorum: a history of the Gothic people with (in the second redaction alone) shorter sections on the Sueves and Vandals down to Isidore's own day.²⁹

22 Edition by Arévalo, *PL* 83.97-130.

23 See *Etymologies* 8.5.66. The *De Haeresibus* edited by Vega and later corrected by Bejarano is normally regarded as Pseudo-Isidorian, see Díaz y Díaz, *De Patristica Española*, pp. 37-39, but *contra* Vega, "El 'Liber de haeresibus'".

24 Edition by Cazier; translation into Italian by Trisoglio.

25 Edition by Martín, translation into English by Wood and Koon.

26 Edition by Arévalo, *PL* 83.449-538; edition of book one by Ziolkowski. For a discussion of the work's purpose, see Bat-Sheva.

27 Edition by Codoñer. Martín, *El Catálogo De Los Varones Ilustres*, argues that this is probably the earliest of Isidore's works.

28 Edition by Campos Ruiz, translation into German by Frank.

29 Edition and translation into Spanish by Rodríguez Alonso, translation into English by Wolf (without the sections on the Sueves and Vandals) and Ford.

Quaestiones (two books): an examination of various Biblical *cruces* derived mainly from earlier Church Fathers.³⁰

Etymologiae or *Origines*: Isidore's last, and major, work, which was posthumously divided by Braulio into 20 books.³¹ It was a compendium of classical and Christian knowledge arranged according to the etymologies of words and became a standard point of reference in the Middle Ages.³²

Apart from these works, a small collection of thirteen of Isidore's letters has also survived.³³ Not on Braulio's list is the *De ordine creaturarum*, a further treatment of the natural world which also incorporates the supernatural heavens. This has often been accepted as Isidore's work, but may well have been composed by an Irish monk of the seventh century.³⁴ The plethora of other writings attributed to him are later, false accreditations, though are a testament of his intellectual standing over the centuries.

For Braulio, through Isidore God had allowed Visigothic Spain 'to mirror the learning of antiquity', as the bishop had brought back to light the works of 'the ancients', thus stopping his own generation growing old through its boorishness.³⁵ As well as contemporary and earlier Christian authors, Isidore makes many direct references to pagan authors as diverse as Aesop, Apuleius, Aristotle, Caesar, Cicero, Lucretius, Ovid, Plato, the Elder Pliny, Quintilian, Sallust, Solinus, Suetonius (in particular his lost encyclopaedia, the *Prata*), Varro, and Virgil. Other classical authors, such as Verrius Flaccus, who wrote his *On the Meaning of Words* in the Augustan period, and the late fourth century grammarian Servius, also influenced Isidore's work. It is difficult, of course, to know with how many of these authors Isidore was

30 Edition by Arévalo, *PL* 83.201-434. The two books or of very uneven size that for the New Testament being very much shorter (*PL* 83.201-208). McNally, who believes that the text of this book is not by Isidore, has produced a revised edition. The much larger book on the Old Testament (*PL* 83.207-434) is often known as the *Mysticorum Espositones Sacramentorum*.

31 Edition by Lindsay. Reproduced with a Spanish translation by Oroz Reta & Marcos Casquero. For an annotated English translation, see Barney, Lewis, Beach and Berghof, *The Etymologies of Isidore of Seville*.

32 Bischoff, 'Die europäische Verbreitung'; Reydellet, 'La diffusion'; McKitterick, 'Glossaries and Other Innovations', pp. 45, 49-50, 67, 71. See also the study by Carlson in this volume.

33 Edition by Arévalo, *PL* 83.893-914, translation into English by Ford.

34 Edition and translation into Spanish by Díaz y Díaz. For study and English translation see Smyth, 'The seventh-century Hiberno-Latin treatise *Liber de ordine creaturarum*'.

35 *nostrum tempus antiquitatis in eo scientiam imaginavit [...] ad restuaranda antiquorum monumenta ne usquequaque rusticitate veteresceremus [...]*, Martín, ed., *Scripta de vita Isidori Hispalensis episcopi*, pp. 199, 205.

directly acquainted; he would probably have known the majority only at second hand via quotations in such authors as Augustine and Cassiodorus.³⁶ It does seem likely however that Isidore had first-hand access to Cicero, Quintilian, Virgil, Lucretius, and Martial. He may also have possessed some of the works of Ovid and Sallust. The so-called *Versus in bibliotheca*, a series of couplets modelled on Martial which were intended to be placed under the busts surmounting the book cases in the cathedral library in Visigothic Seville, mention the Greek Christian authors Origen and John Chrysostom. Isidore devotes one chapter of his *De viris illustribus* to the latter, but it is more likely that he knew John and Origen's works in translation rather than the original.³⁷

Braulio asserted that Isidore's learning was holistic – he had given an account of all branches of knowledge. The *Renotatio* ended with a eulogy of the bishop that was self-consciously adapted from Cicero's praise of the polymath of his own age, Varro.³⁸ The breadth of his work and the sources he drew on have sometimes led to him being described as the last scholar of the ancient world.³⁹ Nothing could be further from the truth. For Isidore the road to hell was indeed paved with ignorance: 'ignorance is the mother of all error and the nurse of vice... the uneducated man is easily deceived, the fool swiftly falls into sin'.⁴⁰ Nevertheless, he was also hostile towards secular learning merely for its own sake; pagan poetry in particular was something he detested.⁴¹ For the bishop the world was a mirror of heaven and

36 Fontaine, *Isidore de Séville*.

37 For a general discussion of Isidore's sources, see Hillgarth, 'The Position of Isidorian Studies'. Although it is sometimes asserted that Isidore knew Greek and Hebrew, as he is described in the late twelfth century *Vita S. Isidori as Latinis Graecis et Hebraeis litteris instructus*, there is no good evidence that this was the case. For an overview of this problem, see Domínguez de Val, *Historia de la antigua literatura latina*, pp. 27-30. There is an edition of the *Versus* by Martín. For a discussion of the problems they raise, see Hamblenne, 'Les Tituli bibliothecae'.

38 The adapted text is Cicero, *Academica Posteriora* 1.3.

39 'Le dernier savant du monde ancien' – the view of the French historian Montalambert, cited by Brehaut, *An Encyclopaedist of the Dark Age*, preface. Brehaut correctly notes that Isidore was also the 'first Christian encyclopaedist and immediately adds 'His writings, therefore, while of no importance in themselves, become important as a phenomenon in the history of European thought.'

40 *Synonima* 2.65, *ignorantia mater errorum est, ignorantia vitiorum nutrix ... indoctus enim facile decipitur. Stultus in vitia cito dilabitur.*

41 One of Isidore's concerns was that it was the pagan poets who had first distorted the meaning of words in order to fit the metrical schemes of their poetry (*Differentiae* 1, *praef.*), but his main animus was that such poetry was founded in pagan religion and thus: *Ideo prohibetur christianus figmenta legere poetarum quia per oblectamenta inanium fabularum mentem excitant ad incentiuua libidinum. Non enim solum tura offerendo daemonibus immolatur, sed etiam eorum*

knowledge of it was but a protreptic to draw the mind away from mundane matters towards first the moral truth that they encapsulated, and finally the theological truth which in turn lay behind the moral truth.⁴² If there was a choice to be made, knowledge of the divine was to be put before that of the world:

‘It will be of no harm to anyone, provided that he speaks truly of God, that through his simplicity he has insufficient knowledge of the elements. For though someone may be unable to discuss the natures of the incorporeal and corporeal, a good life lived with faith will make him blessed.’⁴³

Far from being part of the rearguard of the classical world, Isidore was at the forefront of a new Christian order. But this new order by no means despised learning. Ideally the good man would be an educated man: ‘All wisdom comes from knowledge and conjecture,’ Isidore believes, ‘but an opinion derived from knowledge is better than one derived from conjecture as the former is true, whereas the latter is open to doubt.’⁴⁴ It is perhaps unsurprising therefore that the fourth Council of Toledo over which Isidore presided in AD 633, insisted that there should be an educated secular clergy and made provision for cathedral schools to be set up in every diocese.⁴⁵

While Isidore’s prose style may not be as ‘classical’ as Leander’s, Henderson has shown that he was not insensitive to careful prose composition.⁴⁶ According to Braulio, he could adopt his style to his audience and was outstandingly eloquent when the occasion demanded. The practical nature of the prose in his works shows that he wished them to be of real use, not showcases for his rhetorical ability. His greatest wish was to spread knowledge and thus his faith. In the short term he laid the foundations for the so-called ‘Isidorian renaissance’ of Visigothic Spain, of which his friend

dicta libentius capiendū. ‘The Christian is forbidden to read the compositions of their poets because by the pleasure of their inane fables they provoke the mind to incitements of lust. For a man burns not merely from offering incense to demons, but by too willingly plucking at their words.’ *Sententiae* 3.13.1

42 This is described by Isidore as the *trimodum intelligentiae genus*, ‘threefold form of knowledge’, *Differentiae* 2.154.

43 Nihil obesse cuiquam si per simplicitatem anquam de elementis indigne sentiat, dummodo de Deo vera pronuntiet. Nam quamvis de incorporeis corporeisque naturis nequeat quisque disputare, beatum tamen illum facit vita recta cum fide, *Sententiae* 2.1.1.

44 Omnis sapientia ex scientia et opinione consistit. Melior est autem ex scientia veniens quam ex opinione sententia. Nam illa vera est, ista dubia, *Sententiae* 2.1.8,

45 Canons 24, 25.

46 Henderson, *The Medieval World of Isidore of Seville*.

and posthumous editor of the *Etymologies*, Braulio of Saragossa, was a key part. In the long term the influence of his work in both its geographical and temporal extent show the degree to which that wish was fulfilled.

The aim of this volume is not, however, to offer a ‘maximalist’ interpretation of Isidore’s impact.⁴⁷ Isidore exercised agency in writing his works and intervening in the world around him, yet so too did those who worked with him, notably Braulio, in the early seventh century, as well as those who interacted with and sought to mould his legacy in the decades and centuries that followed. As Michael J. Kelly’s chapter demonstrates, Seville was not the only intellectual centre in the Spain of Isidore’s day. Other cities strove to establish – and in the case of Toledo succeeded – their ecclesiastical and literary dominance within Spain.

Recent studies have begun to reconceptualise the ways in which knowledge was preserved and transmitted in the Roman and post-Roman worlds.⁴⁸ Scholars have explored how information moved between different contexts, in the process charting the varying ways in which cultural objects were transmitted, translated and transformed. Such work has demonstrated how the people of the medieval world – writers, copyists, translators, teachers, students, and other audiences – engaged actively with the cultural legacy of the ancient classical and Christian past. They did not simply pass on the knowledge and traditions that they had inherited from earlier civilisations, even those from which they claimed ancestry and legitimacy, but developed what they had received in many new ways that were designed to respond to contemporary needs.⁴⁹

It is within this context of creative and contextually-grounded engagement with the cultural world of Graeco-Roman and Patristic antiquity that this volume seeks to understand Isidore. Work over the past half-century has demonstrated that the construction of Isidore’s main works was determined, above all, by the context in which he was operating and his desire to influence the society for which he saw the Hispano-Visigothic church as responsible. Political, religious and social considerations influenced Isidore’s writings, but studies have revealed that those writings were intended, in

47 For a ‘minimalist’ view on the impact of Isidore, see: Collins, *Visigothic Spain*.

48 Notable recent work on the Roman context includes König, Oikonomopoulou and Woolf, eds., *Ancient Libraries*; König and Woolf, eds., *Encyclopaedism from Antiquity to the Renaissance*.

49 Wisnovsky, Wallis, Fumo and Fraenkel, eds., *Vehicles of Transmission, Translation, and Transformation in Medieval Textual Culture*; Fischer and Wood, eds., *Western Perspectives on the Mediterranean*; Bremmer and Dekker, eds., *Foundations of Learning*; Bremmer and Dekker, eds., *Practice in Learning*.

turn, to influence the contexts from which they emerged.⁵⁰ As has already been noted, Isidore was not writing in a vacuum and his works represented part of a thorough programme of spiritual education that was intended to have a positive impact on the training of the clergy of Visigothic Spain and, through them, the population as a whole.

The first three chapters in this volume examine some of the innovative ways in which Isidore was influenced by, and made use of the works of, earlier classical and Christian writers. Jamie Wood's 'A Family Affair: Leander, Isidore and the Legacy of Gregory the Great in Spain' examines the rapid and wide-ranging influence of Pope Gregory I (d. 604) in seventh-century Spain. Gregory's works were cited extensively in Spain within a few years of his death and he found eager biographers among the episcopate there. The chapter argues that the cultivation of Gregory's memory aligned well with the efforts of Leander and Isidore to promote an image of their family as a coherent and powerful unit of exceptional Christian leaders. Gregory's meeting with Leander in Constantinople in the early 580s opened up a channel of communication between Rome and Spain that resulted in the early dissemination of Gregory's works there and provided Isidore with the opportunity and the ammunition to build up Gregory's image in Spain. Two imperatives underpinned Isidore's positive portrayal of Gregory and attempt to harness his legacy. First, his writings, especially the *Moralia in Job*, provided vital resources for Isidore's efforts to promote the education of the clergy and, through them, the evangelisation of the population. Second, the association with Leander enabled Isidore to bolster the status of members of his own family, especially Leander, as foundational figures in the history of the Spanish Nicene church.

From Isidore's engagement with the Patristic canon, the next two chapters move on to his use and refutation of classical interpretations of the natural world. In 'Variations on a Theme: Isidore and Pliny on Human and Human-Instigated Anomaly', Mary Beagon examines the use Isidore made of Pliny's *Natural History*, written in the late first century AD, when discussing human and animal anomalies in the *Etymologies*. The chapter demonstrates that Isidore's engagement with Pliny's work was by no means uncritical. Rather than simply copying Pliny's work, Isidore adapted his source so that it accorded with his own ideas about a divine plan that had no room for natural creativity which, if admitted, would undermine the entire

50 E.g. Cazier, *Isidore de Séville et la Naissance de l'Espagne Catholique*; Henderson, *The Medieval World of Isidore of Seville*; Martin, *La géographie du pouvoir dans l'Espagne visigothique*; Merrills, *History and Geography*; Stocking, *Bishops, Councils and Consensus* Wood, *The Politics of Identity*.

Isidorian project of rational categorisation. Isidore's theory of etymology also required the imposition of a sort of natural order on the text that mitigated any possibility of deviation from the divine plan.

Andrew Fear's 'Putting the pieces back together: Isidore and *De natura rerum*' examines Isidore's *De natura rerum* (*DNR*), arguing that the work was written to respond to a specific problem – the appearance of a number of disconcerting natural 'omens' at the beginning of King Sisebut's reign in the early 610s. Isidore used this context to develop a Christianised vision of the natural world in order to reject excessive 'superstition' at the same time as firmly integrating the natural world into a Christian framework. Rather than, as scholars such as Fontaine have suggested, wishing to preserve a separate sphere of secular learning, Isidore actually wished to elide secular and Christian scholarship. The very title *De natura rerum* presents a challenge to Lucretius's didactic poem the *De rerum natura* written in the first century BC. Lucretius's work became a classic in the ancient world and was still read in Visigothic Spain. In it, Lucretius, as a follower of the Greek philosopher Epicurus, presents an entirely atheistic picture of the world whose phenomena carry no meaning beyond themselves. Isidore, deliberately using a title which closely parallels the previous work, mounts a determined refutation of Lucretius, using his themes to argue for a "natural theology" and that in fact only a belief in God can elucidate the natural world.

Isidore thus played the role of a kind of filtering agent, receiving, transforming and reconfiguring existing learning in order to make it useful for the Christian present in seventh century Spain. Alongside work that has explored how Isidore reacted to previous authorities, classical/pagan and Christian, perhaps the strongest trend in recent Isidorian scholarship is to examine the later reception and transmission of his memory and his works across the Latin West.⁵¹ Much of this work has stressed the variability and creativity of the ways in which later writers made use of Isidore's works. The chapters in the second half of this volume underline the fact that Isidorian legacy was by no means monolithic and was at times contested, even within Spain.

Isidore's legacy was by no means unproblematic for the bishops of seventh century Spain, especially those of Toledo who were striving to establish

51 For a survey of the transmission of Isidore's works see: Codoñer, Martín & Andrés Sanz, 'Isidorus Hispalensis ep.' and Reydellet, 'La diffusion' for the *Etymologies*. More recent focused studies include: Di Sciaccia, *Finding the Right Words*; Hussey, 'Transmarinis litteris'; Warntjes, *The Munich Computus*.

their city as the ecclesiastical centre of the kingdom. The Isidorian legacy and the lustre that it lent to Seville were highly problematic in this regard.⁵² Michael J. Kelly's chapter, 'The Politics of History-Writing: Problematizing the Historiographical Origins of Isidore of Seville in Early Medieval Hispania' argues that conflict over Isidore's memory began almost immediately upon his death in 636. Kelly posits the existence of two 'schools' within seventh-century Iberia – that of Isidore/Seville and that of Agali/Toledo – and suggests that competition between the two was manifested, above all and amongst a range of different media, by the production of historical texts that constructed very specific memories of past events and people. Above all, it was in historiographical texts produced by and about Isidore that this conflict played out in the later seventh century and beyond.

Marina Smyth's 'The Reception of Isidore's Writings in Early Medieval Ireland' opens a series of chapters that explore concrete instances of the reception and reuse of Isidore's works outside Spain in the seventh, eighth, and ninth centuries. Some of the earliest traces of Isidore's works outside Spain can be found in manuscripts of Irish provenance and it has long been assumed that Irish monks played a key role in the preservation and transmission of the Isidorian legacy.⁵³ Smyth explores the longstanding assumption that, due to trading contacts between Spain and Ireland, the complete works of Isidore found their way to Ireland very soon after his death in 636.⁵⁴ This assumption has been rendered increasingly untenable by recent studies of the early manuscript transmission of Isidore's works.⁵⁵ The chapter pays particular attention to the *De Natura Rerum* and the various books of the *Etymologiae* in order to generate a more nuanced profile for the transmission of Isidore's works in Ireland.

'Isidore of Seville in Anglo-Saxon England: The *Synonyma* as a Source of Felix's *Vita S. Guthlaci*', by Claudia Di Sciacca, focuses on Anglo-Saxon England. Scholars have long debated the extent to which Bede was influenced by Isidore (both positively and negatively), but more recent works have begun to examine the transmission and impact of Isidore's works on other early Anglo-Saxon writers.⁵⁶ Isidore is now recognised as one of the staple

52 Wood, 'Playing the Fame Game'.

53 See Warntjes, *The Munich Computus*, for the most recent treatment of Isidore's specific legacy in Ireland, Irish-influenced institutions, and the manuscripts that they produced.

54 See Hillgarth, 'Visigothic Spain and Early Christian Ireland' for more general contacts between Visigothic Spain and Ireland.

55 E.g. Warntjes, *The Munich Computus*.

56 E.g. Di Sciacca, *Finding the Right Words*, and Hussey, 'Transmarinis litteris' both explore the transmission of the *Synonyma*. For the influence on Bede see: Fanning, 'Bede, Imperium,

figures of Anglo-Saxon libraries. Di Sciacca investigates the *Synonyma* as a source for one of the founding and most popular texts of Anglo-Saxon hagiography, the Latin life of the hermit-saint Guthlac, a highly literary work authored by the learned monk Felix, an elusive figure of whom nothing is known except that he dedicated his *Vita S. Guthlaci* to Ælfwald, king of the East Angles (c. 713-749). The setting of Guthlac's life itself is Crowland, a demon-infested islet in the fenland between Mercia and East Anglia, and the Mercian-East Anglian associations of the saint and his *uita* seem to offer precious evidence as to the circulation of the *Synonyma* in an age and area of Anglo-Saxon England where knowledge of this Isidorian text is otherwise hardly documented. Moreover, an appreciation of the *Synonyma* within the milieu that produced the *Vita S. Guthlaci*, a locale which seems to have nurtured an interest in eremitic values and a detailed knowledge of some of the key hagiographies concerning the founders of Eastern monasticism, namely the *Vita S. Antonii* and *Vita S. Pauli eremitaie*, offers new and tantalising insights into the literary corpus with which the Isidorian text was probably associated. Such an appreciation can therefore help to further sketch out the Anglo-Saxon library to which the *Synonyma* belonged.

Christopher Heath's *Hispania et Italia: Paul the Deacon, Isidore and the Lombards* fills a surprising gap in scholarship on early medieval historiography by exploring Isidore's influence on the works of Paul the Deacon in the eighth century. Heath demonstrates that despite the somewhat peripheral role that Spain and the Visigoths played in the *Historia Langobardorum*, there are indications that Isidore had a significant influence on specific sections of the work, such as the ethnographic and historical-geographical materials. Moreover, there are indications that certain key parts of Paul's work were crafted with an eye to the *Laus Spaniae* of Isidore. Just as Isidore used previous historians creatively in order to present his Visigoths as a legitimate people in political and religious terms, so Paul the Deacon made selective use of Isidore in order to demonstrate that the Lombards were a *gens* with a long and illustrious history.⁵⁷

Melissa Markauskas's 'Rylands MS Latin 12: A Carolingian example of Isidore's reception into the Patristic Canon?' demonstrates the selective use that later copyists made of Isidore's writings. The chapter examines Rylands MS Latin 12 as a specific and concrete example of unacknowledged copying

and the Bretwaldas'; Wallis, *Bede: The Reckoning of Time*, pp. lxiv-lxvi, lxxx-lxxxiii; Laistner, 'The library of the Venerable Bede', pp. 241, 244, 247, 256, 265. Kendall and Wallis, *Bede: On the Nature of Things and On Times*, 13-20.

⁵⁷ See Wood, *The Politics of Identity*, for Isidore's presentation of the Visigoths in his histories.

of Isidorian material in the Carolingian period. Markauskas demonstrates that Isidore's *De ortu et obitu Patrum* was frequently used as a source for the homiliary, but was clearly marked as a secondary authority through the collection's organisation and visual presentation of Patristic material. Rylands MS Latin 12 thus provides an interesting instance of Isidore's reception in a Carolingian liturgical context, where daily Patristic readings expounding the gospels were valued alongside supplementary biographical material concerning the saint for that day. In this context, it was Isidore's 'data' rather than his 'authority' that was desired. He emerges as a second-level authority who was important, but not so illustrious as to merit explicit citation like the Fathers of the Church.

In the final chapter, 'Adoption, Adaptation, & Authority: The Use of Isidore in the *Opus Caroli*', Laura Carlson delves into the broader influence of Isidore on the Carolingian intelligentsia, a massive topic in need of further study.⁵⁸ The chapter discusses the prevalence of Isidore in the eighth-century *Opus Caroli regis contra Synodum*, the largest extant work on Carolingian spirituality and a text which serves as a signpost to not only his rapid rise to the status of almost Patristic authority, but also his contribution to the development of a Carolingian linguistic philosophy. Isidore's growing status and accessibility within the eighth-century Carolingian intellectual landscape is easily confirmed by both the extant number of his works, not to mention the frequency with which Carolingian writers cite him. The chapter demonstrates that the exposition on the relationship between images and language in the *Opus Caroli* derived from Isidore's linguistic philosophy, developed in his *Etymologiae*, which advocated the widespread applicability of classical linguistic disciplines, such as grammar, rhetoric, and dialectic within the context of Christian spirituality.

Alongside other chapters in the second half of this volume, the exploration of Carolingian-era uses of Isidore by Heath, Markauskas, and Carlson provide further evidence for the flexibility with which Isidore's legacy was treated from 636 onwards. Just as the chapters by Beagon, Fear, and Wood demonstrate that Isidore himself interacted with his sources freely and was not constrained by any particular need to remain 'faithful' to the writings of his predecessors, the chapters on the western European transmission of Isidore's work demonstrate that there was not one Isidorian legacy, but

58 See, for example, Magnou-Nortier, '*L'Admonitio Generalis*'; Eastwood, 'The astronomies of Pliny', pp. 174-177; McKitterick, *History and Memory*, pp. 238-239, 247; McKitterick, 'Glossaries and Other Innovations', pp. 56, 60. Elfassi, 'Les Synonyma d'Isidore de Séville'. For Isidore in Carolingian schools see Roger, *L'Enseignement des lettres classiques*, pp. 195-201.

many.⁵⁹ Furthermore, these legacies were by no means fixed – they were made and remade in response to specific historically-grounded agendas. It is beyond the scope of this volume to examine the continued transmission and transformation of Isidore's works and his image in post-Carolingian Europe (and beyond). It is enough to note that creative adaptation continued to typify the ways in which Isidore was used by later writers and to hope that future publications will explore what is, given the central role of 'Isidorian' methods for organising and transmitting knowledge, a fundamental element of the medieval thought-world.⁶⁰

The interplays between text and context examined in the various studies in this volume demonstrate the need to understand the varied and creative ways by which Isidore's works, wholly and in part, were transmitted and transformed over time. In summary, it is necessary to comprehend the origins and early receptions of Isidorian texts if one is to unpick their later transformations. The chapters in the first half of the volume thus establish the context from which to understand those in the second half, which provide an overview of the different ways in which Isidore's works were received across early medieval Western Europe. Both sections create the necessary context from which to develop a fuller understanding of later receptions of Isidore's work in the post-Carolingian era.

Works Cited

- Andrés Sanz, M^a. Adalaida, *Isidori Hispalensis Liber Differentiarum II = CCSL 111A* (Turnhout: Brepols, 2006).
- Andrés Sanz, M^a. Adalaida, *Prooemia in Veteris et Noui Testamenti libros. Edición crítica = CCSL 111C* (Turnhout: Brepols, forthcoming).
- Arévalo, Faustino, *Sancti Isidori Hispalensis Opera Omnia = PL 81-84* (Roma: Antonii Fulgonii, 1802).
- Barney, Stephen. A., W.J. Lewis, J.A. Beach and Oliver Berghof, *The Etymologies of Isidore of Seville* (Cambridge, Cambridge University Press, 2006).
- Bat-Sheva, Albert, 'Isidore of Seville: His Attitude towards Judaism and his Impact on Early Medieval Canon Law', *Jewish Quarterly Review* 80 (1990) pp. 207-220.
- Beer, Jeanette, *In Their Own Words: Practices of Quotation in Early Medieval History-Writing* (Toronto: University of Toronto Press, 2014).

59 One notable gap in our coverage of the early medieval legacy of Isidore is the lack of coverage of the northern Spain. See Wolf, *Conquerors and Chroniclers*, pp. 25-28, 43-46, for more on this.

60 A notable recent work that engages consistently with the Isidorian legacy in the later medieval period is Franklin-Brown, *Reading the World*. See also Beer, *In Their Own Words*, pp. xii-xiii, 105, 109 for more general Isidorian influence on medieval historical writing in French.

- Bejarano, Virgilio, "Algunas notas gramaticales al 'De Haeresibus Liber' isidoriano", *Emerita* 26 (1958) pp. 65-76.
- Bischoff, Bernhard, 'Die europäische Verbreitung der Werke Isidors von Sevilla', in *Isidoriana* (Leon: Centro de Estudios «San Isidoro», 1960), pp. 317-344.
- Brehaut, Ernest, *An Encyclopedist of the Dark Ages: Isidore of Seville* (New York: Columbia University, 1912).
- Bremmer R.H. and K. Dekker, eds., *Foundations of Learning: The Transfer of Encyclopaedic Knowledge in the Early Middle Ages* [*Mediaevalia Groningana* New Series, 9] (Leuven: Peeters, 2007).
- Bremmer R.H. and K. Dekker, eds., *Practice in Learning: The Transfer of Encyclopaedic Knowledge in the Early Middle Ages* [*Mediaevalia Groningana* New Series, 16] (Leuven: Peeters, 2010).
- Campos Ruiz, Julio, *San Leandro, San Isidro, San Fructuoso. Reglas monásticas de la España visigoda*, (Madrid: Editorial Católica, Biblioteca de Autores Cristianos, 1971).
- Carracedo Fraga, José, *Liber de ortu et obitu patriarcharum* = CCSL 108E (Turnhout: Brepols, 1996).
- Cazier, Pierre, *Isidore de Séville et la Naissance de l'Espagne Catholique* [Théologie Historique 96] (Paris: Beuchesne, 1994).
- Cazier, Pierre, *Isidori Hispalensis Sententiae* = CCSL 111 (Turnhout: Brepols, 1998).
- Chaparro Gómez, César, *De ortu et obitu patrum. Introducción, edición crítica y traducción*. (Paris: Les Belles Lettres, 1985).
- Codoñer, Carmen, *El "De uiris illustribus" de Isidoro de Sevilla* (Salamanca: Consejo Superior de Investigaciones Científicas, 1964).
- Codoñer, Carmen, *Isidoro de Sevilla. Diferencias, libro I. Introducción, edición crítica, traducción y notas* (Paris: Auteurs Latins du Moyen Âge, 1992).
- Codoñer, Carmen, José Carlos Martín and M^a. Adelaida Andrés Sanz, 'Isidorus Hispalensis ep.', in Paolo Chiesa and Lucia Castaldi, eds., *La trasmissione dei testi latini del Medioevo. Mediaeval Latin Texts and their Transmission* [Millennio Medievale 57; Strumenti e Studi, n.s. 10] (Florence: Sismel, Edizioni del Galluzzo, 2005), pp. 274-417.
- Collins, Roger, *Visigothic Spain. 409-711* (Oxford: Blackwell, 2004).
- de Aldama, J.A., 'Indicaciones sobre la cronología de las obras de S. Isidoro', in *Miscellanea Isidoriana. Homenaje a San Isidoro de Sevilla en el XIII centenario de su muerte 636 - 4 de abril 1936* (Rome: Universitas Gregoriana, 1936), pp. 57-89.
- Dekkers, Eligius and Gaar, Aemilius, *Clavis patrum Latinorum*, 3rd ed., (Turnhout: Brepols, 1995).
- Díaz y Díaz, Manuel. C., "De patrística española", *Revista Española de Teología* 17 (1957) pp. 3-46.
- Díaz y Díaz, Manuel. C., *Liber De ordine creaturarum. Un anónimo irlandés del siglo VII. Estudio y edición crítica*. (Santiago de Compostela: Universidad de Santiago de Compostela, 1972).
- Di Sciacca, Claudia, *Finding the Right Words: Isidore's Synonyma in Anglo-Saxon England* (Toronto: University of Toronto Press, 2008).
- Domínguez de Val, Ursicino, *Historia de la antigua literatura latina hispano-cristiana*. III. *San Isidoro de Sevilla* (Madrid: Fundación Universitaria Española, 1998).
- Eastwood, Bruce S., "The astronomies of Pliny, Martianus Capella, and Isidore of Seville in the Carolingian world", in Paul L. Butzer and Dietrich Lohrmann, eds., *Science in Western and Eastern Civilization in Carolingian Times* (Basel: Birkhäuser Verlag AG, 1993), pp. 161-180 [reprinted in Eastwood, Bruce S., ed., *The revival of planetary astronomy in Carolingian and post-Carolingian Europe* [Variorum collected studies series 729] (Aldershot: Ashgate, 2002).
- Elfassi, Jacques, *Isidori Hispalensis* in Chiesa, Paolo and Castaldi, Lucia, eds., *La trasmissione dei testi latini del medioevo* (Florence: Sismel. Edizioni del Galluzzo, 2004) pp. 209-218.
- Elfassi, Jacques, *Isidori Hispalensis episcopi Synonyma* = CCSL, 111B (Turnhout: Brepols, 2009).

- Elfassi, Jacques, 'Les Synonyma d'Isidore de Séville dans l'œuvre de Raban Maur', in Philippe Depreux, Stephanie Lebecq, Michel Perrin and Oliver Szerwiniack, eds., *Raban Maur et son temps* [Collection Haut Moyen Âge, 9] (Turnhout: Brepols, 2010), pp. 247-250.
- Fanning, Steven, 'Bede, Imperium, and the Bretwaldas', *Speculum* 66 (1991), pp. 1-26.
- Ferreiro, Alberto, *The Visigoths in Gaul and Spain, A.D. 418-711: A Bibliography* (Leiden: Brill, 1988).
- Ferreiro, Alberto, *The Visigoths in Gaul and Iberia: A Supplemental Bibliography 1984-2003* (Leiden: Brill, 2006).
- Ferreiro, Alberto, *The Visigoths in Gaul and Iberia (Update): A Supplemental Bibliography, 2004-2006* (Leiden: Brill, 2008). *The Visigoths in Gaul and Iberia (Update): A Supplemental Bibliography 2007-2009* (Leiden: Brill, 2011).
- Fischer, Andreas and Ian Wood, eds., *Western Perspectives on the Mediterranean: Cultural Transfer in Late Antiquity and the Early Middle Ages, 400-800 AD* (London: Bloomsbury, 2014).
- Fontaine, Jacques, *Isidore de Séville et la culture classique dans l'Espagne wisigothique* 3 vols. (Paris: Études Augustiniennes, 1959-1984).
- Fontaine, Jacques and Cazier, Pierre, 'Qui a chasse de Carthaginois Sévérianus et les siens? Observations sur l'histoire familiale d'Isidore de Séville' in *Estudios en Homenaje a Don Claudio Sánchez Albornos sus 90 años. I. Anejos Cuadernos de historia de España*. (Buenos Aires: Instituto de historia de España, Facultad de Filosofía y Letras, 1983).
- Ford, Gordon B., *Isidore of Seville's History of the Kings of the Goths, Vandals, and Suevi* (Leiden: Brill, 1966).
- Ford, Gordon B., *The Letters of St Isidore of Seville*, 2nd ed. (Amsterdam: Adolf M. Hakkert, 1970).
- Frank, Karl Suso, *Hispanische Klosterregeln. Leander von Sevilla: Brief und Regel für Florentina, Isidor von Sevilla: Mönchsregel*, (St. Ottilien: Eos Verlag 2011).
- Franklin-Brown, Mary, *Reading the World: Encyclopedic Writing in the Scholastic Age* (Chicago and London: University of Chicago Press, 2012).
- Hamblenne, Pierre, 'Les Tituli bibliothecae sont-ils d'Isidore?', *La Revue Belge de Philologie et d'Histoire* 80 (2002), pp. 239-256.
- Henderson, John, *The Medieval World of Isidore of Seville: Truth from Words* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2007).
- Hillgarth, Jocelyn N. 'Visigothic Spain and Early Christian Ireland', *Proceedings of the Royal Irish Academy* 62 (1961-1963), pp. 167-194.
- Hillgarth, Jocelyn N. 'The Position of Isidorian Studies: a critical review of the literature, 1936-1975', *Studi Medievali III Serie* 24 (1983), 817-905 [reprinted in his *Visigothic Spain, Byzantium, and the Irish* [Collected Studies 216] (London: Variorum, 1985)].
- Hillgarth, Jocelyn N. 'Isidorian Studies, 1976-1985', *Studi Medievali III Serie* 31 (1990), 925-976.
- Hussey, Matthew T., 'Transmarinis litteris: Southumbria and the Transmission of Isidore's Synonyma', *Journal of English and Germanic Philology* 107 (2008), pp. 141-168.
- Kendall, Calvin B. and Faith Wallis, *Bede: On the Nature of Things and On Times* [TTH 56] (Liverpool: Liverpool University Press, 2010).
- Knoebel, Thomas L., *Isidore of Seville: De Ecclesiasticis Officiis* [ACW 61] (Mahwah, NJ: Paulist Press, 2008).
- König, Jason, Katerina Oikonomopoulou and Greg Woolf, eds., *Ancient Libraries* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2013).
- König, Jason and Greg Woolf, eds., *Encyclopaedism from Antiquity to the Renaissance* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2013).
- Laietner, Max L.W., 'The library of the Venerable Bede', in A. Hamilton Thompson, ed., *Bede: His Life, Times and Writings* (Oxford: Clarendon, 1935), pp. 237-266.

- Lawson, Christopher (ed.), *Sancti Isidori Episcopi Hispalensis De Ecclesiasticis Officiis* = CCSL 113 (Turnhout: Brepols, 1989).
- Lindsay, Wallace M., ed, *Isidori Hispalensis episcopi Etymologiarum sive originum libri XX* 2 vols. (Oxford: Oxford University Press 1911).
- Lozano Sebastian, F.-Javier, *San Isidoro y La Filosofía clásica* (León: Isidoriana Editorial, 1982).
- Magnou-Nortier, Elisabeth, 'L'Admonitio Generalis: Étude critique', in Josep Perarnau, ed., *Jornades internacionals d'estudi sobre el bisbe Feliu d'Urgell. La Seu d'Urgell, 28-30 de setembre de 1999* [Studia, Textus, Subsidia 9] (Barcelona: Facultat de teologia de Catalunya, 2000), pp. 195-242.
- Martin, Céline, *La géographie du pouvoir dans l'Espagne visigothique* (Paris: Septentrion, 2003).
- Martin, John R.C., *Saint Leander, Archbishop of Seville. A book on the teaching of nuns and a homily in praise of the Church* (Plymouth: Lexington Books, 2009).
- Martín, José Carlos, ed., *Scripta de vita Isidori Hispalensis episcopi: Braulionis Caesaraugustani episcopi Renotatio librorum domini Isidori; Redempti clerici Hispalensis Obitus beatissimi Isidori Hispalensis episcopi; Vita sancti Isidori ab auctore anonymo saeculis XI-XII exarata* = CCSL 113b (Turnhout: Brepols, 2006).
- Martín, José Carlos, 'El Catálogo De Los Varones Ilustres de Isidoro De Sevilla (*Cpl* 1206): Contenidos y Datación', *Studia Historica: Historia Antigua*, 31 (2013) pp. 129-151.
- Martín, José Carlos, *Isidori Hispalensis Chronica* = CCSL 112 (Turnhout: Brepols, 2003).
- Martín, José Carlos, *Isidori Hispalensis Versus* = CCSL 113.1 (Turnhout: Brepols, 2000).
- Martín, José Carlos, *La Renotatio librorum domini Isidori de Braulio de Zaragoza (†657)* (Logroño: Fundación San Millán de la Cogolla, 2002).
- Martín, José Carlos, *Scripta de vita Isidori episcopi Hispalensis Renotatio librorum Isidori; Obitus Isidori; Vita Isidori* = CCSL 113B (Turnhout: Brepols, 2006).
- McKitterick, Rosamond, 'Glossaries and Other Innovations in Carolingian Book Production', in Erik Kwakkel, Rosamond McKitterick, and Rodney Thomson, eds., *Turning Over a New Leaf: Change and Development in the Medieval Book* (Leiden: Leiden University Press, 2012), pp. 21-76.
- McKitterick, Rosamond, *History and Memory in the Carolingian World* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2004).
- McNally, Robert E., 'Der irische Liber de numeris. Eine Quellenanalyse des pseudo-isidorischen Liber de numeri', (Munich: Universität München, 1957).
- McNally, Robert E. 'Isidoriana', *Theological Studies* 20, (1959), pp. 432-442.
- McNally, Robert E., 'The Pseudo-Isidorian 'De Vetere et Novo Testamento Quaestiones'', *Traditio* 19 (1963) pp. 37-50.
- Merrills, A.H., *History and Geography in Late Antiquity* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2005).
- Oroz Reta, José. & Marcos Casquero, Manuel-Antonio, *Etimologías edición bilingüe* (Madrid: Editorial Católica, Biblioteca de Autores Cristianos, 1982).
- Reydellet, Marc, 'La diffusion des *Origines* d'Isidore de Séville au Haut Moyen Âge', *Mélanges d'archéologie et d'histoire* 78 (1966), pp. 383-437.
- Rodríguez Alonso, Cristobal, *Las Historias de los godos, vándalos y suevos de Isidoro de Sevilla: estudio, edición crítica y traducción* (León: Centro de Estudios e Investigación "San Isidro", 1975).
- Roger, Maurice, *L'Enseignement des lettres classiques d'Ausone à Alcuin. Introduction à l'histoire des écoles carolingiennes* (Hildesheim: Georg Olms, 1968).
- Smyth, Marina, 'The seventh-century Hiberno-Latin treatise *Liber de ordine creaturarum*. A translation', *Journal of Medieval Latin*, 21 (2011), pp. 137-222.

- Stocking, Rachel L., *Bishops, Councils and Consensus in the Visigothic Kingdom, 589-633* (Ann Arbor: The University of Michigan Press, 2000).
- Throop, Priscilla, *Isidore of Seville's Synonyms (Lamentations of a sinful soul) and Differences* (Charlotte, Vermont: MedievalMS, 2012).
- Trisoglio, Francisco, *La natura delle cose* (Rome: Città Nuova, 2001).
- Trisoglio, Francisco, *Le sentenze di Isidoro di Siviglia. Introduzione, traduzione e comment* (Brescia: Morcelliana Edizioni, 2008).
- Vega, Ángel Custodio, 'El "Liber de haeresibus" de San Isidoro de Sevilla y el "Código Ovetense", *La Ciudad de Dios* 172 (1958) 241-270.
- Vega, Ángel Custodio, *S. Isidori Hispalensis Episcopi De Haeresibus liber* (Madrid: Real Monasterio de El Escorial, 1940).
- Viñayo González, Antonio, *San Isidoro de Sevilla: Sinónimos* (León: Editorial Isidoriana, 2001).
- Vives, José, ed., *Concilios Visigóticos e Hispano-Romanos* (Barcelona & Madrid: Consejo Superior de Investigaciones Científicas, Instituto Enrique Flórez, 1963).
- Wallis, Faith, *Bede: The Reckoning of Time* [TTH 29] (Liverpool: Liverpool University Press, 1988).
- Warntjes, Immo, *The Munich Computus: Text and Translation. Irish Computistics between Isidore of Seville and the Venerable Bede and its reception in Carolingian times* [Sudhoffs Archiv: Zeitschrift für Wissenschaftsgeschichte 59] (Stuttgart: Franz Steiner Verlag, 2010).
- Wisnovsky, Robert, Faith Wallis, Jamie C. Fumo and Carlos Fraenkel, eds., *Vehicles of Transmission, Translation, and Transformation in Medieval Textual Culture* (Turnhout: Brepols, 2011).
- Wolf, Kenneth B., *Conquerors and Chroniclers of Early Medieval Spain*, 2nd edition, [TTH 9] (Liverpool: Liverpool University Press, 1999).
- Wood, Jamie, and Koon, Sam, 'The Chronica Maiora of Isidore of Seville: An introduction and translation', *e-Spania*, 6 (2008): <http://e-spania.revues.org/15552> (last accessed February 2015).
- Wood, Jamie, 'Playing the Fame Game: Bibliography, Celebrity and Primacy in Late Antique Spain', *Journal of Early Christian Studies*, 20.4 (2012), pp. 613-40.
- Wood, Jamie, *The Politics of Identity in Visigothic Spain: Religion and Power in the Histories of Isidore of Seville* [Series on the Early Middle Ages 21] (Leiden: Brill, 2012).
- Ziolkowski, Vernon P., *The De Fide Catholica contra Iudaeos of Saint Isidorus, Bishop, Book 1 (Latin Text)*, Saint Louis University, PhD (1982).