

The Refugee Crisis: Factual Background and Legal Considerations

The Gap between the needs of the contemporary Asylum Crisis and legal Response of the ${\it EU}$

Tanja Pfleger

The Refugee Crisis: Factual Background and Legal Considerations

The Gap between the needs of the contemporary Asylum Crisis and legal Response of the EU

Tanja Pfleger



The Refugee Crisis: Factual Background and Legal Considerations

The Gap between the needs of the contemporary Asylum Crisis and legal Response of the EU

Tanja Pfleger

ISBN: 9789462404755

Nolf Legal Publishers (WLP) P.O. Box 313 5060 AH Oisterwijk The Netherlands www.wolfpublishers.com E-Mail: sales@wolfpublishers.nl

All rights reserved. No part of this publication may be reproduced, stored in a retrieval system, or transmitted in any form or by any means, electronic, mechanical, photocopying, recording or otherwise, without prior written permission of the publisher. Whilst the authors, editors and publisher have tried to ensure the accuracy of this publication, the publisher, authors and editors cannot accept responsibility for any errors, omissions, misstatements, or mistakes and accept no responsibility for the use of the information presented in this work.

Content

Abbreviations List of Tables and Figures		vii xi	
Intr	oduction	I	
I.	Factual Background	5	
	Current Status	5	
B. O	rigins of the present asylum crisis	5	
I.	51 1	6	
2.	1 8	8	
3.	_	9	
	. Iraq	II	
5.	Dictatorships, combats and turmoil in Africa	II	
	a) Eritrea	II	
	b) South Sudan	13	
	c) Somalia	13	
	d) Nigeria	13	
	e) Congo f) Central African Republic	14	
6	. The lack of financial resources	15	
	common migratory routes to and through Europe and associated	15	
	roblems	16	
I.	3.6.10	18	
2.	71.36.1	19	
3.		23	
3	a) Detention Centres	23	
4.	. Western Balkan route	32	
5.	Hungary	35	
	a) The Hungarian-Serbian Fence	36	
	a) Advertisements	37	
	b) New Laws	38	
2.	Xenophobia and racism	38	
3.		4 I	
4		45	
	a) Population's sense of solidarity	47	
II.	Legislation Background	49	
A. R	efugees and asylum in international law	49	
I.	Overview of refugees and providing asylum in history	52	
2.	United Nations Organization	54	

3.	High Commissioner for Refugees and the UN Refugee Agency	54			
4.	4. The 1951 Convention and 1967 Protocol				
5. Definition of a refugee according article 1A (2) of the 1951					
	Convention	56			
6.	Main contents of the Convention	62			
	a) Rights of refugees	63			
	(I) The principle of non-refoulement	65			
В.	EU refugee and asylum law	67			
I.	The Council of Europe	67			
2.	The European Court of Human Rights	68			
3.	Commissioner for Human Rights	69			
4.	Law of the European Union	69			
5.	Schengen System	70			
	a) Schengen free travel zone	73			
	b) Conduct of border checks	74			
	c) FRONTEX	75			
	The Common European Asylum System	76			
7.	The right to asylum and different categories of protection	82			
	a) Uniform status of asylum pursuant to article 78 (2) lit a of				
	the TFEU	83			
	b) Uniform status of subsidiary protection pursuant to				
	article 78 (2) lit b of the TFEU	84			
8.	Determination of the responsible Member State (Art 78 (2) (e)				
	TFEU)	86			
	a) Eurodac Database	87			
9.	Asylum Procedures	90			
	a) Procedural safeguards	92			
	b) Right to effective remedy and legal assistance	94			
	c) Accelerated Procedure	98			
	d) Concept of safe country of origin and safe third country	99			
	. Collective expulsion	102			
II.	Detention	103			
	a) Detention Conditions	107			
	b) Procedural safeguards	109			
III.	Conducted and planned measures on EU level	115			
A De	eaths at sea – smuggling problem	116			
	esettlement	119			
	location	119			
	risis relocation Mechanism	121			
	ot Spots	121			
	ommon EU list of safe countries of origin	122			
	rica related plans	123			
	ans with Turkey	124			

	Western Balkan countries/Further international cooperation Infringement Procedures	126 128
	osing words bliography	131 133
AN	NNEXES	
CO	NVENTION AND PROTOCOL RELATING TO THE STATUS OF REFUGEES	161
CO	NVENTION FOR THE PROTECTION OF HUMAN RIGHTS AND FUNDAMENTAL	
FRE	EEDOMS, AS AMENDED BY PROTOCOLS NO. 11 AND 14; ROME, 4.XI.1950	215
DIR	EECTIVE 2011/95/EU OF THE EUROPEAN PARLIAMENT AND OF THE COUNCIL	
	13 DECEMBER 2011 ON STANDARDS FOR THE QUALIFICATION OF THIRD-	
CO	UNTRY NATIONALS OR STATELESS PERSONS AS BENEFICIARIES OF	
INT	ERNATIONAL PROTECTION, FOR A UNIFORM STATUS FOR REFUGEES OR	
FOF	R PERSONS ELIGIBLE FOR SUBSIDIARY PROTECTION, AND FOR THE CONTENT	
OF '	THE PROTECTION GRANTED	231
DIR	EECTIVE 2013/32/EU OF THE EUROPEAN PARLIAMENT AND OF THE COUNCIL	
	26 JUNE 2013 ON COMMON PROCEDURES FOR GRANTING AND	
	THDRAWING INTERNATIONAL PROTECTION	249
DIR	RECTIVE 2013/33/EU OF THE EUROPEAN PARLIAMENT AND OF THE COUNCIL	
	26 JUNE 2013 LAYING DOWN STANDARDS FOR THE RECEPTION OF	
	PLICANTS FOR INTERNATIONAL PROTECTION	285

Abbreviations

Cartagena Declaration

AFSI Area of freedom, security and justice Asylum Act Act LXXX of 2007 on Asylum (Hungary)

Asylum Procedures Directive Directive on common procedures for granting

and withdrawing international protection BC

before Christ

CAT Convention Against Torture and Other Cruel,

Inhuman or Degrading Treatment or Punishment Cartagena Declaration on Refugees, Colloquium

on the International Protection of Refugees in

Central America, Mexico and Panama Common European Asylum System

CEAS CETS Council of Europe Treaty Series

ch chapter

CJEU Court of Justice of the European Union

(before December 2009: ECJ)

CoE Council of Europe

Convention 1951 Convention as amended by the 1967 Protocol

Council Council of the European Union

Dublin Regulation Regulation establishing the criteria and mechanism

for determining the Member State responsible for

examining an application for international

third-country national or a stateless person

protection lodged in one of the Member States by a

EASO European Asylum Support Office

EC European Community

ECHR European Convention for the Protection of

Human Rights and Fundamental Freedoms

ECHR Reports of Judgments and Decisions (used in

Footnotes for Cases of the ECtHR)

ECI European Court of Justice (after December 2009:

CJEU)

ECtHR European Court of Human Rights

EC Treaty Consolidated Version of the Treaty establishing

the European Community

EU Charter Charter of Fundamental Rights of the

European Union

Eurodac Regulation Regulation on the Establishment of 'Eurodac' for

> the Comparison of Fingerprints for the effective Application of Regulation (EU) No 604/2013 establishing the Criteria and Mechanisms for determining the Member State responsible for examining an Application for International

> Protection lodged in one of the Member States by

a Third-Country National or a Stateless Person and on Requests for the Comparison with Eurodac Data by Member States' Law Enforcement Authorities and Europol for Law Enforcement Purposes, and amending Regulation (EU) No 1077/2011 establishing a European Agency for the Operational Management of large-scale IT Systems in the Area of Freedom, Security and

Justice

EASO European Asylum Support Office **EUROJUST** European Judicial Cooperation Unit **EUROPOL** European Law Enforcement Organisation

ed editor edition edn eds editors exempli gratia e.g.

European Union **EU Charter** Charter of Fundamental Rights of the European

Union

Regulation on the Establishment of 'Eurodac' for Eurodac Regulation

the Comparison of Fingerprints for the effective Application of Regulation (EU) No 604/2013 establishing the Criteria and Mechanisms for determining the Member State responsible for examining an Application for International Protection lodged in one of the Member States by a Third-Country National or a Stateless Person and on Requests for the Comparison with Eurodac Data by Member States' Law Enforcement Authorities and Europol for Law Enforcement Purposes, and amending Regulation (EU) No 1077/2011 establishing a European Agency for the Operational Management of large-scale IT Systems in the Area of Free dom, Security and Justice and the following and Europol for Law Enforcement Purposes, and amending Regulation (EU) No 1077/2011 establishing a European Agency for the Operational Management of large-scale IT

Systems in the Area of Free dom, Security

and Justice

and the following

European Union Agency For Fundamental Rights

European Agency for the Management of Operational Cooperation at the External

Borders of the Member States

ff

FRA

EU

FRONTEX

FRONTEX Regulation Regulation establishing a European Agency for

the Management of Operational Cooperation at the External Borders of the Member States

of the European Union

ibid in the same place

IDP Internally displaced person(s)

ICCPR International Covenant on Civil and Political

Rights

i.e. id est

IS Islamic State

ISIS Islamic State in Iraq and Syria

IOM International Organization for Migration

km kilometre m metre

MSF Médecins sans Frontières

NATO North Atlantic Treaty Organization NGO non-governmental organization

no number(s)

OAU Convention Convention governing the specific

Aspects of Refugee Problems in Africa

OECD Organisation for Economic Co-operation and

Development

OIN Office of Immigration and Nationality

(Bevándorlási és Állampolgársági Hivatal,

BÁH)

OJ Official Journal paragraph part

Qualification Directive Directive on standards for the qualification of

third-country nationals or stateless persons as beneficiaries of international protection, for a uniform status of refugees or for person eligible for subsidiary protection, and for the content of the protection granted Reception

Conditions

Directive Directive laying down standards for the reception

of applicants for international protection

Refugee Convention 1933 Convention Relating to the International

Status of Refugees

Return Directive Directive on common standards and procedures in

Member States for returning illegally staying

third-country nationals

Schengen Borders Code Regulation establishing a Community Code on

the Rules governing the Movement of Persons

across Borders

TEU Consolidated Version of the Treaty on

European Union

UDHR Universal Declaration of Human Rights

UK United Kingdom UN United Nations

UNGA United Nations General Assembly
UNHCR United Nations High Commissioner for

Refugees

UNTS United Nations Treaty Series USA United States of America

v versus vol volume

1933 Convention Convention Relating to the International

Status of Refugees

1951 Convention1967 ProtocolConvention Relating to the Status of RefugeesProtocol Relating to the Statute of Refugees

List of Tables and Figures

Figure 1. War parties in Syria	9
Figure 2. Refugees in Africa	14
Figure 3. Origins of Asylum Seekers in the EU in 2015	16
Figure 4. Mediterranean Routes	19
Figure 5. Dead and missing migrants in the Mediterranean	21
Figure 6. Areas in which migrant deaths appear	22
Figure 7. Greece's islands as near the Turkish coastline	29
Figure 8. Arrivals from Turkey to Greece per month	31
Figure 9. Western-Balkan Route	33
Figure 10. Voters of anti-immigrant parties	40
Figure 11. Schengen Zone	72

Introduction

Since humans' existence, there have always been people fleeing. Throughout human history their numbers have not decreased, but instead, quite the contrary: the world community has at all times been and is now particularly challenged by the prospect of helping the people in need of protection across borders.

It is very important to be aware of the fact that refugee and asylum issues involve countless individuals' lives. In these pursuits, legislation and its implementation often affect human beings in a very immediate and profound way. The European sea rescue program "Mare Nostrum," for instance, rescued thousands of people. As soon as it was stopped, the death count in the Mediterranean Sea increased again. Furthermore, for each and every statistic, a lost life and a destroyed family stand behind it. For the individual who is in danger, it means everything to be able to get him/herself and his/her family to safety.

The world community has recognised this simple fact and has long since made provisions for relief to those in danger in international politics and legislation.

In 2015, refugee and asylum issues topped headlines all over the world and especially in Europe. All sectors of society and levels of government discussed the matter. Politicians have been trying to find a proper solution ever since, which has turned out to be a very difficult pursuit as they all have different solutions in mind. Conservative or open-minded in their respective state approach towards refugees, everybody has had to obey the law.

The intention of this book is to give an overview of the current asylum crisis. Although legislation and regulations will be explained, this book is designed for beginners in this field and laypeople as well. In order to keep the subject manageable, the subject will be addressed with the following scopes:

I

In terms of time, the main focus is on the year 2015, as there was a tremendous increase in people fleeing and reaching Europe in that year alone. That leads to the geographical restrictions and coverage. It is limited to the European continent and the main destination countries there.

The first part scrutinises the origins of the asylum crisis and the routes of displaced people who aim to reach Europe, and what obstacles they have to face therein. Developments up to the 31st December 2015 are considered.

The second part provides an introduction to international and European refugee and asylum legislation in an overview and how the handling of persons in need of international protection by authorities in factual reality deviates from the legal requirements. Here, special emphasis lies on Greece and Hungary as two countries which are the main entry points for asylum-seekers and therefore find themselves in a difficult position. Possible human rights violations and violations of EU law will be pointed out, but not scrutinised in detail.

The third part describes measures the European Union has taken to tackle the crisis. Plans through February 2016 are taken into consideration.

It is important to note that the word refugee doesn't have only one meaning. In contemporary usage, the word refugee exists in two senses. While the ordinary sense is very broad and comprehensive, the legal sense is stringent and restricted to certain criteria.¹

In the factual background part the word refugee is not related to the stringent criteria of the legal sense, instead used in a broader way. Refugees are here people who are in flight, may it be due to

٠

See II.A.5 Further reading: Goodwin-Gill G, The Refugee in International Law (2nd edn, Oxford University Press 1998) 3-31.

INTRODUCTION

prosecution, certain conditions, war, famine or natural catastrophes. People who are seeking a better life are called as migrants. Since humans' existence, there have always been people fleeing. Throughout human history their numbers have not decreased, but instead, quite the contrary: the world community has at all times been and is now particularly challenged by the prospect of helping the people in need of protection across borders.

It is very important to be aware of the fact that refugee and asylumissues involve countless individuals' lives. In these pursuits, legislation and its implementation often affect human beings in a very immediate and profound way.

In 2015, refugee and asylum issues topped headlines all over the world and especially in Europe. All sectors of society and levels of government discussed the matter. Politicians have been trying to find a proper solution ever since, which has turned out to be a very difficult pursuit as they all have different solutions in mind. Conservative or open-minded in their respective state approach towards refugees, everybody has had to obey the law.

In this book the author presents an overview of the current asylum crisis. Although legislation and regulations will be explained, this book is designed for beginners in this field and laypeople as well.

The first part scrutinises the origins of the asylum crisis and the routes of displaced people who aim to reach Europe, and what obstacles they have to face therein. The second part provides an introduction to international and European refugee and asylum legislation in an overview and how the handling of persons in need of international protection by authorities in factual reality deviates from the legal requirements. The third part describes measures the European Union has taken to tackle the crisis.

