

Dutch Transnational Feminist Solidarity Activism across North-South Divides 1975-2018

Dutch Transnational Feminist Solidarity Activism across North-South Divides 1975-2018

IREEN DUBEL



Cover image: Design by Anneke Maessen (Frissewind, Amsterdam) based on picture by Irene Slegt of wall mural by Vrouwenschilderkollektief Singel 445 Amsterdam, 1988 Picture author: Don Wijns (Frissewind, Amsterdam)

© 2025 Ireen Dubel Uitgeverij Verloren bv Torenlaan 25 1211 JA Hilversum www.verloren.nl

ISBN 978 94 6455 186 0

Cover design: Anneke Maessen, Frissewind, Amsterdam Layout: Rombus/Eva Nicole Pool, Hilversum

No part of this book may be reproduced in any form without written permission from the publisher.

I have attempted to ascertain the rights of the images used. If you think you own the copyright of any of the images in this book, please contact the author via the publisher.

Dedication

To my parents who passed on the passion for reading

To Engelien who accompanied me during the first steps in the second feminist wave To Mia, Maria and Kumari who passed on the skill to think, question and reflect

To Geertje who shared the agility of political advocacy

To Yvonne and Chenjerai who passed on the passion for and art of playing with words To Jaap for providing room to take risks

To Leontine for your continued trust, support and belief in my ability to write

Contents

Prelude		11
1	Introduction	12
	Money matters	12
	A rich feminist heritage	13
	Contextualising development and development cooperation	16
	Contexualising 1975 – emerging social movements in the Netherlands	18
	Guiding questions and concepts	21
	Methods and data collection	32
	Structure of the book	33
	Postscript	35
Pa	rt One: Pivotal Pioneers 1975-1985	
2	1975 'Not just a year, but a lifetime for women'	41
	Introduction	41
	Contextual challenges	41
	Cold War politics	43
	International Women's Year	43
	Dutch propositions for Mexico City	44
	Dutch positions at the conference	46
	Politics at the tribune	49
	IWY legacy	50
	Conclusion	52
3	Pioneering Feminist Advocacy and Knowledge Production	54
	Introduction	54
	NGOs as a channel for development cooperation	54
	Sex and gender disaggregation	55
	Encountering arrogance, ignorance and resistance	56
	Co-financing agencies dragging their feet	57
	Advocacy success	58
	Funding women's movements and organisations	60
	Gadfly with iron influence	62

	Women and Development Studies pioneers	63
	Decolonising and intersectional research avant la lettre	68
	ISS W&D legacy	74
	Conclusion	75
4	From 'Population Control No!' to Reproductive Rights	76
	Introduction	76
	We Women Demand	76
	From local to transnational organising	77
	Fundraising politics	79
	Mobilising feminist forces	81
	Reproductive rights and wrongs	82
	Preparations for the International Conference on Population	85
	The politics of population issues	86
	The birth of the Global Gag Rule	89
	Reproductive rights advocacy post-1984	90
	Conclusion	92
5	Taking Stock of the Women's Decade	93
	Introduction	93
	International contextual challenges for gender equality policies	94
	Dutch challenges and opportunities for gender equality policy	94
	In search for a new paradigm	96
	Dutch advocacy for Nairobi	99
	A lesbian feminist coalition	101
	Bleak prospects	103
	Forum '85	105
	Dutch positions in Nairobi	108
	Coming of age	111
	Conclusion	112
Εp	oilogue: Pivotal Pioneers	115
Pa	rt Two: Influencing Institutions 1986-1995	
6	Gender Knowledge Brokers	121
	Introduction	121
	Advocacy for autonomy	121
	Autonomy criticised	123
	Policy development – the case of Hivos	127
	Gender training	129
	A quest for tools	132

	Challenges and dilemmas of institutionalisation and	
	North-South partnerships	134
	Conclusion	136
7	Malibongwe for a Non-Racial, Non-Sexist South Africa	138
	Introduction	138
	Preparing for post-apartheid	138
	Mobilising material and political support	139
	Racist birth and population control	141
	Shifting perspectives	144
	Organisational tour de force	147
	Malibongwe's significance	151
	Transition politics	156
	Challenges of international solidarity	158
	Conclusion	160
8	Women's Human Rights out of the Brackets	162
	Introduction	162
	Contextual opportunities and challenges	162
	Engendering environmental issues in Rio de Janeiro	164
	Women's rights are human rights in Vienna	166
	Reproductive rights and abortion in Cairo	171
	Holding the line in Copenhagen	174
	A long and winding road to Beijing	176
	Dutch preparations for Beijing	177
	Contestations and compromises in Beijing	179
	Post-Beijing Post-Beijing	183
	Conclusion	184
Εp	ilogue: Influencing Institutions	186
Pa	rt Three: Moving into the New Millennium 1996-2005	
9	Sexual Rights out of the Closet	191
	Introduction	191
	Terminology	192
	1995 – homophobia and LGBT rights in Southern Africa	192
	From HIV/AIDS to LGBT rights	194
	From homophobia to international LGBT advocacy	196
	Preparations for the Gay Games	199
	A pink week in Amsterdam	201
	The significance of the Gay Games	205

Post-1998 Gay Games	206
Conclusion	208
10 Abortion Activists Make Waves	209
Introduction	209
1999 – Cairo+5 review	209
New medical technology – a new avenue and threat	211
Entrepreneurial feminist activism	212
Navigating the waves	214
Wrangling with Dutch abortion politics	218
Women on Web – post-clinic abortion access and care	221
From transnational to domestic entrepreneurial feminist activism	223
Conclusion	227
11 Beijing's Unfulfilled Promises	228
Introduction	228
High expectations	228
Narrowing domestic gender issues and dismantling feminist	
advocacy capacity	229
Women and development no longer a policy priority	232
A new global agenda for the 21st century	234
International and national political junctures	235
Gender, peace and security	236
After the Dutch 2002 critical juncture	238
Beijing+10	240
Conclusion	244
Epilogue: Moving into the New Millennium	246
Part Four: Resilience and Reinvigoration 2006-2018	
12 Where is the Money?	251
Introduction	251
The MDGs and gender mainstreaming	251
International feminist impetus	252
Review of gender mainstreaming	253
International perspectives on gender mainstreaming	255
Building national momentum	256
Building international momentum	260
Launching the MDG3 Fund at the 2008 CSW	262
MDG3 Fund recipients	264
Austerity politics and securing the MDG3 Fund	265

Gender mainstreaming revisited	267
Competing for government attention and finance	268
Conclusion	269
13 Investing in Women	271
Introduction	271
Juggling with instrumental framing	271
FLOW I	273
'Smart' security	273
Feminist leadership on aid, trade and investments	275
Beijing+20	277
Securing earmarked funding for women's movements	279
Unresolved dissent	282
SheDecides	286
Domestic gender and LGBT equality policy	287
An advocacy victory thanks to CEDAW	289
Conclusion	291
Epilogue: Resilience and Reinvigoration	293
Conclusion	
14 Looking Back to the Future	299
Introduction	299
Advocacy outcomes	299
Movement dynamics	301
Explaining the outcomes and sustainability of transnational feminist	302
solidarity advocacy Contentious aspects of Dutch transnational feminist solidarity advocacy	308
Transnational feminist solidarity revisited	312
Epilogue: Looking at the future from a crossroads in 2025	314
Acknowledgements	317
Annex List of Cabinets, (junior) Ministers and Political Parties	320
Biographies	326
List of Abbreviations	342
Notes	345
Sources	393
Bibliography	397
Illustrations and Photographic Acknowledgements	431
Index	433

Prelude

Artists are like cockroaches – besides flat-bellied and creepy, they hang upside down on walls and ceilings. From there their vision is constantly swirling: their knowledge based on eavesdropping upon half sentences and hearsay. However this kind of visual artist insists on a double antenna held firmly to the ground.¹

With this metaphor, Zimbabwean author Yvonne Vera challenged the Dutch arts establishment gathered at the Royal Palace on Dam Square in Amsterdam on 19 December 1997. It was the first time the Prince Claus Fund awards were presented. She had been asked to deliver the keynote address because the Zimbabwe International Book Fair was to receive the principal award. At the time, the annual book fair, well-known in Southern Africa, attracted readers, emerging and eminent writers, and publishers from across the continent and beyond. It was where Vera and I met for the first time in 1995. We became friends through our shared passion for books and words. The circle of friends included Zimbabwean writer Chenjerai Hove, who, like Vera, was an award-winning author. Both were firm believers in the power of story-telling and the arts and saw them as indispensable for development. They taught me the joy of writing and capturing stories. By the time I started writing this book, I could no longer ask them for guidance because both had died too young. Still, I felt encouraged by their legacy. Speaking to an audience of young emerging writers, Hove said:

Writing means searching for truths: my experience is that there is not a single truth about anything. Thus, the job of a writer also means continuous dreaming, searching for all sides to life. But as we know, life is a mirage, always shifting its distance the nearer we think we are. ... To write is to doubt. A good writer is never too sure about anything. Continue doubting, for it is in doubting the validity of issues that we grow.²

While exploring the history of transnational feminist solidarity activism and advocacy, I aspired to 'look back to the future', taking guidance from the Aymara people's understanding of life in the Andes as an experience and valuation of 'walking backwards into the future'. During my journey, I looked at what we have done in the past and are doing in the present. As Hove said, my doubts increased as I tried to understand the recent past and present, which were constantly shifting as the writing journey progressed. In this book, I have tried to use Vera's double antenna of the cockroach, held firmly to the ground for eavesdropping, and doubted the validity of what I've heard and read, including my own notes over the years. The validity of what I have collected and written is ultimately for the reader to judge.

1 Introduction

Money matters

It was February 2008. In one of the large conference rooms in the basement of the headquarters of the United Nations (UN) in New York City, I struggled to keep focused on what seemed to be an endless number of formal, sleep-inducing speeches about national efforts or intentions. I was attending a three-hour high-level round table on 'Financing for gender equality and the empowerment of women' on the opening day of the 52nd session of the Commission on the Status of Women (CSW).¹ According to UN pecking order, ministers spoke first, followed by heads of national delegations, UN diplomats and civil servants flown in from national capitals. At last, the chair tuned to representatives from three pre-selected non-governmental organisations (NGOs), and it was my turn.

I spoke on behalf of the Dutch development agency Humanist Institute for Co-operation with Developing Countries (Hivos). My statement was short. I pointed to a negative trend of divesting in gender equality and empowerment of women and girls and the persistent gap between policy intentions and implementation. I argued that the human and financial resources required were inadequate and fell short of what was promised in the rhetoric of governments' and development agencies' gender equality policies. I ended with a demand to scale up resources, especially for women's rights organisations, which are prime drivers of the women's rights and gender equality agendas.³



Ireen Dubel at CSW 2008

A RICH FEMINIST HERITAGE 13

Peggy Antrobus from Barbados spoke next on behalf of the international feminist network Development Alternatives for Women in a New Era (DAWN), a Hivos partner organisation at the time.⁴ Her speech emphasised some of the global macro-economic and geopolitical trends that impacted financing for gender equality such as trade liberalisation, the international security agenda, and debt repayment requirements. Of all the session speakers, only the two of us received warm applause. We were sitting behind



Peggy Antrobus at CSW 2008

the South African delegation. Zanele Mbeki, South Africa's first lady at the time, turned around and thanked us for our speeches. She asked why she had to wait for more than two and a half hours to finally hear something sensible. My thoughts were somewhat different. I was reflecting on the extremely disappointing speeches I had just heard with hardly any new commitments or fresh ambitions for the women's rights agenda. No progress seemed to have been made in implementing the *Beijing Platform for Action*, the global framework for women's rights that had been agreed upon by all governments in the world with great enthusiasm and zeal thirteen years before, in 1995.

A rich feminist heritage

How I ended up with an invitation to speak at the UN is a long story, which intertwines with stories of other feminists whose travels are interwoven and connected to mine. This book is about feminists who, like me, engaged with Global South-focused and international solidarity and policy advocacy from 1975 to the end of the 2010s. Feminists in the Netherlands who engage with transnational solidarity constitute an important segment of the Dutch women's movement. I call this segment the transnational feminist solidarity movement. I use the term transnational in this book for Dutch activism targeting transnational spaces and policies. Therefore, the transnational solidarity movement is not transnational in an organisational sense, in terms of structure and membership. In targeting venues and forums at multiple levels – local-national-regional-international-global – the transnational feminist solidarity movement distinguishes itself from the part of the Dutch women's movement that mobilises on domestic gender equality issues and that engages at transnational levels to advance domestic gender equality issues. The movement of black, migrant and refugee women in the Netherlands – as part of the Dutch women's movement – is also active at multiple levels and engages with domestic, transna1 INTRODUCTION

tional and international women's issues. There are no clear dividing lines. Individuals and organisations can simultaneously engage with domestic and transnational/international gender equality issues and be part of different segments of the Dutch women's movement.

The origin of the contemporary transnational feminist solidarity movement can be traced back to 1975, the International Women's Year (IWY), which catalysed Dutch feminists' interests in the position of women in the Global South and transnational feminist solidarity in a context of decolonisation and post-colonial North-South struggles. The transnational engagement of Dutch women with women's issues in the South was not new. Dutch women and (women's) organisations have historically engaged with the position of women in the Dutch colonies. This engagement traditionally took the form of missionary and philanthropic work with a moral appeal to superior Christian values and Western civilisation. In the late 19th and early 20th century, Dutch feminists and women's organisations have organised transnationally around issues of peace, women's suffrage and women's leadership. Therefore, an analysis of Dutch women's contemporary engagement with women's issues and gender relations in the South must take note of possible continuities between colonial civilisation efforts and more recent development efforts. The contemporary Dutch transnational feminist solidarity movement has often worked in tandem with feminists from other countries in pursuit of the shared ambition to advance equal rights, opportunities and outcomes for women and girls around the world. Resource mobilisation for women's and feminist movements has been both an important strategy and objective of Dutch transnational feminist solidarity.

So far, the solidarity and advocacy efforts of this group of Dutch activists have gone largely unnoticed. Publications on the history of the 'Third World' solidarity movement and Dutch development cooperation either contain a single chapter on women and gender equality issues or none at all.⁸ Literature discussing the emergence of various social movements in the Netherlands from the mid-1960s onwards has not paid much attention to feminist solidarity activism focused beyond the Netherlands.⁹ The same is true for most accounts of what became known as 'second wave' feminist activism in the Netherlands.¹⁰

My activism and work have taken me to numerous venues, meetings and countries. I have travelled between organisations, networks and spaces of activism with different roles and responsibilities. My most formative years were as a student at the Institute of Social Studies (ISS) in The Hague in the company of a majority of fellow students from the Global South and our inspirational lecturers Maria Mies, Kumari Jayawardena and Mia Berden.¹¹ I have had the privilege and joy to meet, engage, and develop friendships with fellow feminist activists in landscapes of women's movements throughout the world, transnational solidarity activism, and Dutch and international development cooperation. My privilege has been manifold. I have been exposed to and challenged by ideas and practices of feminists from around the world, forcing me to revise my feminist priorities and understanding of feminists sol-

A RICH FEMINIST HERITAGE 15

idarity. Access to financial resources provided me with the opportunity to support women's rights organisations and networks and to collaborate with incredibly brave, bold and bright feminists throughout the world. That said, my privileged position as a feminist donor has also implied that dynamics of power inequality have been part of these collaborations, which are themselves embedded in structural North-South and East-West divides they seek to address.¹²

The silence about our advocacy efforts is one of the reasons I decided to write this book. My aim was to develop a participant history of Dutch Global South-oriented advocacy and transnational feminist solidarity, partly drawing on accounts of lived experiences, including my own. It is a partial history as I have selected narratives on key events and moments of significance that occurred during the period covered in the book, most of which I participated myself or became part of at a later stage. Writing the book made me aware of the importance of a triple reflexivity regarding my position, as a person from the North and embedded in North-South divides, as a researcher and as a subject of research. In the process of writing, the book became another kind of journey for me. While documenting exemplary events, specific policy claims, successes and failures of feminist advocacy, and contestations over policy demands and implementation, I became interested in more than telling an overlooked story. I was struck by the contrast between the timeline, dynamics and sustainability of transnational feminist solidarity engagement with women's rights and gender equality issues in Dutch foreign and development cooperation policy over time and those of feminist engagement with gender equality issues in domestic policy. I have looked at transnational feminist solidarity actors and their engagement from the perspective of a social movement. For this, I have used Srilatha Batliwala's definition of social movements. Batliwala has drawn on many scholarly definitions and defined social movements as 'an organized set of constituents pursuing a common political agenda of change through collective action.'13 With this book, I hope to contribute to an understanding of how Dutch women's rights and gender equality activists have organised for transnational feminist solidarity and advocated feminist goals in Dutch development cooperation and foreign policy, since 1975.

Before discussing this question and the concepts that I have used to analyse specific cases of transnational feminist solidarity and North-South policy advocacy, I briefly reflect on the origins of the idea of 'development' and 'development assistance' that led to the emergence of development cooperation as a policy area, a community of practitioners, and development studies scholarship. The interaction between feminism and development has contributed to the emergence of Dutch transnational feminist solidarity engagement aimed at the Global South. In addition, I briefly discuss the emergence of new social movements in the Netherlands in the late 1960s and 1970s, because two of these movements have contributed to the emergence of Dutch transnational feminist solidarity activism. They have inspired and, in part, shaped the politics of several actors that feature in the book.

In this book, Ireen Dubel analyses the so far unnoticed history of nearly five decades of Dutch transnational feminist solidarity with women's rights in the Global South in particular.

This history begins in 1975, the International Women's Year, which ignited contemporary Dutch transnational feminist solidarity engagement. Archival research, interviews with key actors and first-hand documentation of events and policy claims form the rich empirical grounding of the book's case studies. These include a variety of solidarity initiatives, ranging from safeguarding reproductive rights and access to safe abortion, to supporting women under apartheid. recognising women's rights at the UN, promoting sexual rights and diversity, and mobilising political and financial support for women's movements around the world.

By discussing specific case studies of solidarity activism and policy advocacy, Dubel offers compelling evidence and an explanation for the sustainability and outcomes of Dutch transnational feminist solidarity activism. This history has the power to inspire contemporary and future transnational feminist solidarity engagement.

9789464551860

